

1 [Counsel listed on next page.]
2
3
4
5
6
7
8

9 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
10 CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
11

12 DELAYNA GATLIN, as an individual,
13 SANDRA GATLIN, as an individual,
14 and on behalf of all others similarly
situated,

15 Plaintiffs,

16 vs.

17 UNITED PARCEL SERVICE, INC., an
18 Ohio corporation; and DOES 1 through
19 100,

20 Defendants.
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

Case No. 2:18-cv-03135-SVW (ASx)

~~PROPOSED~~] PROTECTIVE
ORDER

Judge: Hon. Stephen V. Wilson
Courtroom: 10A

1 PAUL K. HAINES (SB# 248226)
2 TUVIA KOROBKIN (SB# 268066)
3 STACEY M. SHIM (SB# 305911)
4 phaines@haineslawgroup.com
5 tkorobkin@haineslawgroup.com
6 sshim@haineslawgroup.com
7 HAINES LAW GROUP, APC
2274 East Maple Avenue
El Segundo, CA 90245
Telephone: (424) 292-2350
Facsimile: (424) 292-2355

8 SCOTT M. LIDMAN (SB# 199433)
9 ELIZABETH NGUYEN (SB# 238571)
10 slidman@lidmanlaw.com
11 enguyen@lidmanlaw.com
12 222 N. Sepulveda Boulevard, Suite 1550
El Segundo, CA 90245
Telephone: (424) 322-4772
Facsimile: (424) 322-4775

13 Attorneys for Plaintiffs
14 DELAYNA GATLIN and SANDRA GATLIN
15

16 ELIZABETH A. BROWN (SB# 235429)
17 E. JEFFREY GRUBE (SB# 167324)
18 AMANDA BOLLIGER CRESPO (SB# 250292)
19 CLAIRE A. HOFFMANN (SB# 292584)
20 lisabrown@gbgllp.com
21 jeffgrube@gbgllp.com
22 amandacrespo@gbgllp.com
23 clairehoffmann@gbgllp.com
GRUBE BROWN & GEIDT LLP
633 West 5th Street, Suite 3330
Los Angeles, CA 90071
Telephone: (213) 358-2810
Facsimile: (213) 358-2820

24 Attorneys for Defendant
25 UNITED PARCEL SERVICE, INC.
26
27
28

1 1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

2 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential,
3 proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public
4 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may
5 be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to
6 enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this
7 Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to
8 discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends
9 only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment
10 under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth
11 in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to
12 file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the
13 procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a
14 party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

15
16 B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

17 This action is likely to involve the exchange of records and information
18 referencing or otherwise reflecting certain business practices, internal procedures,
19 customer information, and other valuable research, development, commercial,
20 financial, technical and/or proprietary information for which special protection
21 from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecution of this
22 action is warranted. Such protected materials/information consist of, among other
23 things, confidential business or financial information, information regarding
24 confidential business practices, or other confidential research, development, or
25 commercial information (including information implicating privacy rights of third
26 parties), information otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be
27 privileged or otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes,
28 court rules, case decisions, or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of

1
2 information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of
3 discovery materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to
4 keep confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses
5 of such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their
6 handling at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order
7 for such information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that
8 information will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that
9 nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a
10 confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part
11 of the public record of this case.
12

13 2. DEFINITIONS

14 2.1 Action: The above-captioned case, *Delayna Gatlin, as an individual,*
15 *Sandra Gatlin, as an individual, and on behalf of all others similarly situated,*
16 *Plaintiffs, v. United Parcel Service, Inc., an Ohio corporation; and does 1 through*
17 *100, Defendants.* (C.D. Cal. Case No. 2:18-cv-03135-SVW-AS).

18 2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the
19 designation of information or items under this Order.

20 2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of
21 how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for
22 protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in
23 the Good Cause Statement.

24 2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as
25 their support staff).

26 2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or
27 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as
28 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

1 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless
2 of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,
3 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced
4 or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

5 2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
6 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as
7 an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

8 2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.
9 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside
10 counsel.

11 2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association,
12 or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

13 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a
14 party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and
15 have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm
16 which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

17 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
18 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
19 support staffs).

20 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
21 Discovery Material in this Action.

22 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation
23 support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
24 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
25 and their employees and subcontractors.

26 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
27 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

28 2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery

1 Material from a Producing Party.

2
3 3. SCOPE

4 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
5 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or
6 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or
7 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or
8 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

9 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the
10 trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

11
12 4. DURATION

13 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations
14 imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees
15 otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be
16 deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this action, with
17 or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and
18 exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action,
19 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time
20 pursuant to applicable law.

21
22 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

23 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

24 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under
25 this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that
26 qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for
27 protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written
28 communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents,

1 items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept
2 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

3 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
4 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
5 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to
6 impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the
7 Designating Party to sanctions.

8 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
9 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
10 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

11 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in
12 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
13 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
14 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
15 produced.

16 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

17 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic
18 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial
19 proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend
20 "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that
21 contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page
22 qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected
23 portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

24 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection
25 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated
26 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
27 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be
28 deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the

1 documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine
2 which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then,
3 before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the
4 “CONFIDENTIAL legend” to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a
5 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing
6 Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making
7 appropriate markings in the margins).

8 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party
9 identify the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the
10 deposition all protected testimony.

11 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary
12 and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place
13 on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the
14 legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information
15 warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the
16 protected portion(s).

17 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
18 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive
19 the Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such
20 material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make
21 reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the
22 provisions of this Order.

23 24 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

25 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
26 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court’s
27 Scheduling Order.

28 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute

1 resolution process under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.

2 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on
3 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper
4 purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other
5 parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating
6 Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall
7 continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is
8 entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the
9 challenge.

10
11 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

12 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
13 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
14 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such
15 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the
16 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a
17 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL
18 DISPOSITION).

19 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
20 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
21 authorized under this Order.

22 7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless
23 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
24 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated
25 "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:

26 (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this Action,
27 as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably
28 necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

1 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House
2 Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this
3 Action;

4 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to
5 whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
6 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

7 (d) the court and its personnel;

8 (e) court reporters and their staff;

9 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and
10 Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action
11 and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit
12 A);

13 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information
14 or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

15 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses,
16 in the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the
17 deposing party requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit A hereto;
18 and (2) they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they
19 sign the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless
20 otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of
21 transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected
22 Material may be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to
23 anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

24 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting
25 personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement
26 discussions.

27 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED
28 IN OTHER LITIGATION

1 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
2 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as
3 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

4 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification
5 shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

6 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order
7 to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the
8 subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall
9 include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

10 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be
11 pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

12 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with
13 the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this
14 action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the
15 subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s
16 permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
17 protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions
18 should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action
19 to disobey a lawful directive from another court.
20

21 9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE
22 PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

23 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a
24 Non-Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information
25 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
26 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be
27 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

28 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to

1 produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
2 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's
3 confidential information, then the Party shall:

4 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-
5 Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality
6 agreement with a Non-Party;

7 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated
8 Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably
9 specific description of the information requested; and

10 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the
11 Non-Party, if requested.

12 (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within
13 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party
14 may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery
15 request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall
16 not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the
17 confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court.
18 Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and
19 expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

20 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

21 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed
22 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this
23 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in
24 writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best
25 efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the
26 person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of
27 this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment
28 and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE
PROTECTED MATERIAL

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to the court.

12. MISCELLANEOUS

12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

1 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

2 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60
3 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must
4 return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As
5 used in this subdivision, “all Protected Material” includes all copies, abstracts,
6 compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the
7 Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the
8 Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if
9 not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60-day deadline that
10 (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was
11 returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any
12 copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or
13 capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel
14 are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial,
15 deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition
16 and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert
17 work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival
18 copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective
19 Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

20
21 14. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all
22 appropriate measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or
23 monetary sanctions.

24
25 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

26 DATED: May 3, 2018

HAINES LAW GROUP, APC
LIDMAN LAW, APC

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

BY: /s/ Scott M. Lidman
SCOTT M. LIDMAN

Attorneys for Plaintiffs
DELAYNA GATLIN and SANDRA
GATLIN

The undersigned attests that the signatory listed above concurs in the content
of this document and has authorized its filing.

DATED: May 3, 2018

GRUBE BROWN & GEIDT LLP

BY: /s/ Amanda Bolliger Crespo
AMANDA BOLLIGER CRÉSPÓ

Attorneys for Defendant
UNITED PARCEL SERVICE, INC.

FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.

DATED: May 7, 2018

/ s /
Honorable Alka Sagar
United States Magistrate Judge

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [print or type full name], of
_____ [print or type full address],
declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the
Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for
the Central District of California on _____ [date] in the case of *Delayna
Gatlin, as an individual, Sandra Gatlin, as an individual, and on behalf of all
others similarly situated, Plaintiffs, v. United Parcel Service, Inc., an Ohio
corporation; and does 1 through 100, Defendants.* (C.D. Cal. Case No. 2:18-cv-
03135-SVW-AS). I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this
Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so
comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I
solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item
that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in
strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court
for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this
Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after
termination of this action. I hereby appoint: _____
[print or type full name] of _____ [print
or type full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of
process in connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of
this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: _____

City and State where sworn and signed: _____

Printed name: _____

Signature: _____